BENEFITS AND CHALLENGES OF ONLINE COLLABORATIVE PROJECTS FOR EFL STUDENTS: A NARRATIVE REVIEW



RESEARCH PAPER

submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Sarjana Pendidikan at English Education Department

By

WILDA FATMAYUNI NIM: 19010106004

FACULTY OF EDUCATION AND TEACHER TRAINING INSTITUT AGAMA ISLAM NEGERI KENDARI KENDARI



KEMENTERIAN AGAMA REPUBLIK INDONESIA INSTITUT AGAMA ISLAM NEGERI KENDARI FAKULTAS TARBIYAH DAN ILMU KEGURUAN

Jalan Sultan Qaimuddin No. 17 Kelurahan Baruga, Kendari, Sulawesi Tenggara Telp/Fax. (0401) 3193710/ 3193710

email: jainkendari@yahoo.co.id website: http://jainkendari.ac.id

LEGALIZATION SHEET

This is to certify that the research paper by Wilda Fatmayuni, SID 19010106004, entitled "Benefits and Challenges of Online Collaborative Projects for EFL Students: A Narrative Review" has been presented in the research examination on July 04, 2023, and declared acceptable as one of the requirements for obtaining a degree (S.Pd.).

Kendari, <u>July 04, 2023</u> 15 Dzulhijjah 1444 H

BOARD OF EXAMINERS

Chair : Dr. Sitti Nurfaidah, S.Pd., M.Ed.

Members : Azwar Abidin, M.Pd.

: Suhartini Syukri, S.Pd.I., S.Pd., M.Pd.

: Dewi Atikah, M.A. TESOL

Approved by,

Dean of the Faculty of Education and Teaching Training

Dr. Masdin, M.Pd.

NIP. 196712311999031065

Visi Program Studi Tadris Bahasa Inggris (TBI):

"Menghasilkan tenaga pendidik pada bidang Pendidikan Bahasa Inggris yang berkualitas, berkepribadian Islami, dan berwawasan transdisipliner pada tahun 2025"

DECLARATION OF AUTHORSHIP

I am Wilda Fatmayuni SID. 19010106004, hereby certify that the research result entitled "Benefits and Challenges of Online Collaborative Projects for EFL Students: A Narrative Review" under the supervision of Dr. Sitti Nurfaidah, S.Pd., M.Ed., and Azwar Abidin, M.Pd. has been obtained and presented following academic rules and ethical conduct of IAIN Kendari. It is written and published as a requirement for the degree of English Education Program, Tarbiyah, and Teacher Training Faculty at IAIN Kendari. For this reason, I am responsible for the research paper if there is any objection or claim from others.



HALAMAN PERNYATAAN PERSETUJUAN PUBLIKASI TUGAS AKHIR UNTUK KEPENTINGAN AKADEMIS

Sebagai sivitas akademik Institut Agama Islam Negeri Kendari, saya yang bertanda tangan di bawah ini:

Nama : Wilda Fatmayuni

NIM : 19010106004

Program Study : Tadris Bahasa Inggris

Fakultas : Tarbiyah dan Ilmu Keguruan

Jenis Karya* : Skripsi

Demi pengembangan ilmu pengetahuan, menyetujui untuk memberikan kepada Institut Agama Islam Negeri Kendari Hak **Bebas Royalti Noneklusif** (*Noneklusive Royalty-Free Right*) atas karya ilmiah saya yang berjudul:

Benefits and Challenges of Online Collaborative Projects for EFL Students: A Narrative Review

Beserta perangkat yang ada jika (jika diperlukan). Dengan Hak bebas Royalti Nonekslusif ini Institut Agama Islam Negeri Kendari berhak menyimpan, mengalih media/formatkan, mengelola dalam bentuk pangkalan data (*database*), merawat, dan mempublikasikan tugas akhir saya selama tetap mencantumkan nama saya sebagai penulis/pencipta dan sebagai pemilik Hak Cipta.

KENDAR

Demikian pernyataan ini saya buat dengan sebenarnya

Dibuat : Kendari

Pada tanggal : 15 Mei 2023

Yang menyatakan

Wilda Fatmavuni

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

الرحيم الرحمن الله بسم

Alhamdulillah, praise and thank Allah SWT, the world's Lord; thanks for all His blessing and everything given to me in completing my study and this research paper. Peace be upon our prophet Muhammad *shalallahu'alaihi* wasallam, who has guided us from the darkness to the lightness.

While completing this research paper, I realized that it would not have been done without help, support, encouragement, contribution, and suggestion from several sides, especially to my parents, Mando and Wati, as my big motivation in my life finishing my study. Thanks for your constant support and prayers until I can complete my study. Thanks for your significant contribution to my life by providing me with a good education. I dedicate all my achievements in this study to my beloved big family, especially my parents. Other thanks are also delivered to:

- 1. Prof. Dr. Faizah Binti Awad, M.Pd., the Rector of Institut Agama Islam Negeri Kendari.
- 2. Dr. Masdin, M.Pd., the Dean of the Faculty of Tarbiyah and Teacher Training.
- 3. Sarjaniah Zur, S.Pd., M.Pd., the Head of the English Education Department. She is one of my favorite lecturers. The lecturer who always smiles and is friendly to everyone, including the students she meets. Hopefully, I can be like her, who is always nice to everyone.
- 4. Dr. Sitti Nurfaidah, M.Ed., my beloved mentor. She was essential to my studies while studying in the English Department. She has spent time becoming my supervisor in my field teaching practice and my first thesis

- supervisor. The title of my research was the idea given by her. Thank you so much for your support, knowledge, guidance, and patience in teaching me a lot, especially about writing and research. May God reward you with kindness.
- 5. Azwar Abidin, M.Pd., as my second supervisor, thanks for guiding me in complementing this thesis online and offline. He always provides the best solution when I am confused about my thesis. May Allah constantly blesses you and keep you safe from all bad things.
- 6. Suhartini Syukri, S.Pd.I., S.Pd., M.Pd., a lecturer in the English education program who served as my first thesis examiner. Thank you for sharing so much knowledge that you have so that I can improve the part of my thesis that is still lacking.
- 7. Dewi Atikah, M.A. TESOL., as my second examiner, thank you for providing critical advice and good input so I can quickly revise and complete my thesis.
- 8. Abdul Halim, S.Pd., M. TESOL., as a lecturer who previously held the position of the Head of the English Education Department. Thank you for teaching, motivating, advising, and directing me throughout my studies. I love the way he teaches and interact with his students.
- 9. All of the lecturers of the English Department, Hj. Isna Humaera, S.Ag., S.Pd., M.Pd., Susanti, M.Pd., Anita Rezki, S.Pd., M.Pd., Muh. Kurniawan Rahman, S.Pd., M.Pd., Ilfan Askul Pehala, S.Pd., M.Hum., Nur Hasanah Safei, M.Pd., and Sean Ryan, as my great lecturers in the English Education Department, thank you for all the valuable knowledge you have taught me. May Allah protect you all and bless you all.

- 10. All lecturers and staffs of IAIN Kendari, thank you for all the knowledge that has been shared.
- 11. To my beloved siblings, Warnida, Wahida, Wanda, and Isal, thank you for your love, support, and care during my education. May Allah protect and bless you all.
- 12. All my families, thank you for your prayers and support for my studies.
- 13. Fifi S., Putri Mawaddah, Anindita, and Refi Yulianita. Thank you for the fun, laughter, and precious time together. Thank you for always being there, inspiring, encouraging, and supporting me. I was lucky to meet and fight alongside you guys in completing this study. Thank you for being a part of my university life. Hopefully, our friendship will last even when we are no longer at the university.
- 14. My Kost Abbas girls, I would like to thank you for being so kind and sympathetic; you guys are the best people who always care and help me. I honestly do not know what I would do without you guys. I hope our friendship will always remain for the rest of our life.
- 15. My classmates in Engdept A 19, Thank you for the four years we have spent together; this is an unforgettable memory. I hope this is not the end of our deliberations.
- 16. My neighbor's class, which is Engdept. B 2019, my senior and junior of TBI IAIN Kendari, who always support me in the educational process.

Finally, I would like to thank everyone whom I cannot mention individually. It does not mean I forgot you guys; however, my most profound

appreciation goes to all of you. I also realize that this research paper is far from perfect. Hopefully, this research paper is beneficial for the readers.

Kendari, 15th May, 2023

The Researcher

NIM. 19010106004

Wilda Fatmayuni

KENDARI

ABSTRACT

Wilda Fatmayuni. SID. 19010106004. Benefits and Challenges of Online Collaborative Projects for EFL Students: A Narrative Review. Supervised by: Dr. Sitti Nurfaidah, S.Pd., M.Ed. and Azwar Abidin, M.Pd.

This narrative review investigates the benefits and challenges EFL students perceived during online collaborative projects using activity theory as an analytical framework. The data in this study were taken from 30 selected articles published in 2013-2022. This study identified findings in each article related to online collaborative projects of EFL students. The findings were synthesis that met predetermined eligibility through matrix synthesis. The findings from 30 articles revealed that the benefits of online collaborative projects outweigh the challenges. In addition, the online collaborative method is also useful because it can provide educators with valuable information about language and student online interaction performance. This study implies that educators are advised to anticipate and overcome challenges in implementing online collaboratively as a language learning method.

Keywords: benefits; challenges; EFL students; narrative review; online collaborative projects

TABLE OF CONTENTS

TITLE PAGE	
APPROVAL SHEET	i
LEGALIZATION SHEET	ii
DECLARATION OF AUTHORSHIP	iv
HALAMAN PERNYATAAN PERSETUJUAN PUBLIKASI	1
ACKNOWLEDGEMENT	V
ABSTRACT	У
TABLE OF CONTENTS	X
LIST OF TABLES	xii
LIST OF FIGURES	xiv
CHAPTER 1 INTRODUCTION	1
1.1 Background of the Study	1
1.2 Scope of the Study	4
1.3 Research Question	
1.4 Purpose of the Study	
1.5 Significance of the Study	
1.6 Definition of Key Terms	1 5
CHA <mark>P</mark> TER II LITERATURE REVIEW	Ć
2.1 T <mark>he</mark> oretical Framework	Ć
2.1.1 Online Collaborative Learning	Ć
2.1.2 Online Collaborative Projects	7
2.1.3 The Role of Technology Tools as a Platform in Online	
Collaborative Projects	Ģ
2.1.4 Benefits of Online Collaborative Projects	10
2.1.5 Challenges of Online Collaborative Projects	12
2.1.6 Activity Theory	14
2.2 Previous Study	18
CHIA DEED HI	2.1
CHAPTER III	21
3.1 Research Design	21
3.2 Setting and Context	22
3.3 Technique of Data Collection	22
3.4 Technique of Data Analysis	23
CHAPTER IV FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION	31
4.1 Findings	31
4.1.1 Benefits of Online Collaborative Projects	32
4.1.1 Promoting Maximum Outcomes	37
1,1,1,1 1 10HIOHHE WIGHHUIH OULOHIOD,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,	-, 1

4.1.1.2 Supporting Appropriate Use of Tools (Features and	
Feasibilities)	39
4.1.1.3 Practicing Collaboration Skills	40
4.1.1.4 Conforming to Collaborative Rules	41
4.1.1.5 Offering Flexibility in the Role Assignment	42
4.1.2 Challenges of Online Collaborative Projects	43
4.1.2.1 In-Group Disagreement	46
4.1.2.2 Incompetence in Certain Skills	47
4.1.2.3 Delays in Project Finishing and Completion	48
4.1.2.4 Technical Issues in the Devices	48
4.1.2.5 Delayed or Slow Response	49
4.2 Discussion	50
CHAPTER V CONCLUSION	55
5.1 Conclusion	55
5.2 Limitation	57
5.3 Pedagogical Implication	57
5.4 Recommendation	58
	77
REFERENCES	60
APPENDICES	68
Appendix 1	68
Appendix 2	71
Appendix 3	74
Appendix 4	77
Appendix 5	79
Appendix 6	106
Appendix 7	107

LIST OF TABLES

Table 3.1	Inclusion and Exclusion Criteria	23
Table 3.2	Sample of Synthesis Matrix	25
Table 3.3	Sample of Coding Procedure	28
Table 4.1	Benefit Factor Categories and Descriptions	33
Table 4.2	Benefit Factors between Components of an Activity System	37
Table 4.3	Challenging Factor Categories and Descriptions	44
Table 4.4	Challenging Factors between Components of an Activity System	46



LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 2.1	First Generation of Activity Theory	16
Figure 2.2	Second Generation of Activity Theory	17

